

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA
WESTERN DIVISION

CIVIL ACTION NO.: 5:22-cv-00068-BO

YOLANDA IRVING, individually and as the)
natural parent and guardian of J. I., JUWAN)
HARRINGTON, CYDNEEA HARRINGTON,)
KENYA WALTON, individually and as the)
natural parent and guardian of R.W., ZIYEL)
WHITLEY, DYAMOND WHITLEY,)
KAMISHA WHITLEY, NANETTA GRANT as)
the natural parent and guardian of Z. G., and)
EMANCIPATE NC., INC.)
)
Plaintiffs,)
vs.)
)
THE CITY OF RALEIGH, Officer OMAR I.)
ABDULLAH, Sergeant WILLIAM ROLFE,)
Officer RISHAR PIERRE MONROE, Officer)
JULIEN DAVID RATTELADE, and Officer)
MEGHAN CAROLINE GAY, Officer DAVID)
MEAD, Officer JESUS ORTIZ, Officer KYLE)
PERRIN, Officer MICHAEL MOLLERE,)
Officer, KYLE THOMPSON, Officer)
VINCENT DEBONIS, Officer DANIEL)
TWIDDY, Officer THOMAS WEBB, Officer)
DAVID MCDONALD, Officer DAVID)
GARNER, Chief of Police ESTELLA)
PATTERSON and City Manager MARCHELL)
ADAMS-DAVID, in their official capacities.)
)
Defendants.)

**Defendant Gay, Monroe and Rattelade's Appendix of Exhibits to Local Civil Rule 56.1
Statement of Material Facts**

<u>Description</u>	<u>Page No.</u>
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317, 323 (1986)	3
<i>Cray Commc'ns, Inc. v. Novatel Computer Sys., Inc.</i> , 33 F.3d 390, 393–94 (4th Cir. 1994)	3

<i>Ridpath v. Bd. of Governors Marshall Univ.</i> , 447 F.3d 292, 306 (4th Cir. 2006)	3
<i>Wilson v. Layne</i> , 526 U.S. 603, 609, 119 S.Ct. 1692, 143 L.Ed.2d 818 (1999)	3-4
<i>Anderson v. Creighton</i> , 483 U.S. 635, 640, 107 S.Ct. 3034, 97 L.Ed.2d 523 (1987)	4
<i>Harlow v. Fitzgerald</i> , 457 U.S. 800, 818, 102 S.Ct. 2727, 73 L.Ed.2d 396 (1982)	4
<i>Pearson v. Callahan</i> , 555 U.S. 223, 236, 129 S.Ct. 808, 172 L.Ed.2d 565 (2009)	4
<i>Bailey v. Polk</i> , 2011 WL 4565469 (W.D.N.C. March 7, 2011)	5, 17
<i>Franks v. Delaware</i> , 438 U.S. 154, 171 98 S. Ct. 2674 (1978)	5
<i>Miller v. Prince George's County, Md.</i> , 475 F. 3d 621, 627 (4th Cir. 2007)	5
<i>Hinkle v. City of Clarksburg, W. Va.</i> , 81 F.3d 416, 421 (4th Cir. 1996)	5
<i>Hafner v. Brown</i> , 983 F.2d 570, 577 (4th Cir. 1992)	5-6
Excerpts from Deposition of Sergeant Julien David Rattelade taken February 28, 2023	6-9, 15
Excerpts from Deposition of Officer Meghan Gay taken October 28, 2022	6-8
<i>Randall v. Prince George's Cty</i> , 302 F.3d 188, 204 (4 th Cir. 2002)	6
Excerpts from Deposition of Officer Rishar Pierre Monroe taken January 31, 2023	7-9
<i>U.S. v. Lattimore</i> , 87 F.3d 647, 650 (4th Cir. 1996)	9, 11
<i>Schneckloth</i> , 412 U.S. at 225, 93 S.Ct. 2041	9-10
Excerpts from Deposition of Dyamond Whitley taken February 3, 2023	10-11
Excerpts from Deposition of Kenya Walton taken November 15, 2022	10, 12-13
<i>U.S. v. Seni</i> , 662 F.2d 277, 281-82 (4 th Cir. 1981)	11

<i>U.S. v. Elie</i> , 111 F.3d 1135, 1143-44 (4th Cir. 1997)	11
Excerpts from Deposition of Robert Whitley, Jr. taken November 17, 2022	11, 13
Excerpts from Deposition of Z.G. taken November 18, 2022	11, 15
<i>U.S. v. Alexander</i> , 2008 WL 11422070, at *5 (M.D.N.C. Dec. 1, 2008)	12
<i>U.S. v. Carter</i> , 300 F.3d 415, 423 (4th Cir. 2002)	13
<i>King</i> , 563 U.S. at 460, 131 S. Ct. 1849	13
<i>Lange</i> , 141 S. Ct. 2011	13-14
<i>Riley</i> 573, U.S. at 402, 134 S. Ct. 2473	13-14
<i>Brigham City</i> , 547 U.S., at 403, 126 S.Ct. 1943	14
<i>Minnesota v. Olson</i> , 495 U.S. 91, 100, 110 S.Ct. 1684, 109 L.Ed.2d 85 (1990)	14
<i>Birchfield v. North Dakota</i> , 579 U. S. 438, ——, 136 S.Ct. 2160, 2174, 195 L.Ed.2d 560 (2016)	14
Excerpts from Deposition of Officer David Mead taken November 1, 2022	14-15
Excerpts from Deposition of Officer Daniel Twiddy taken February 24, 2023	15
<i>Michigan v. Summers</i> , 452 U.S. 692, 701-02 (1981)	17
<i>U.S. v. Enslin</i> , 327 F.3d 788, 796-97 (9th Cir. 2003)	17